Tucson’s STAR Experience: the Rating versus the Framework
STAR as a Framework

* 2008 Framework for Advancing Sustainability
  * All environmental
  * Based on existing policy
* 2012 mandate to update Framework
  * Grant competitiveness
* Sustainability Framework = Local values + STAR
  * In our own words
  * Too many objectives
  * Needed to add elements
  * It IS a pilot...
City’s Personal Safety: Government and empowered residents collaborate to reduce and prevent crime and violence, foster pro-social behaviors such as non-violent conflict resolution, and promote a sense of personal safety in all aspects of daily life.

Original STAR Safe Communities: Create safe, peaceful and thriving communities where all government sectors actively collaborate with each other and with residents as empowered partners to foster pro-social behaviors, prevent and reduce crime and violence, and promote non-violent conflict resolution.

Final STAR Safe Communities: Prevent and reduce violent crime and increase perceptions of safety through interagency collaboration and with residents as empowered partners.
Updated Sustainability Goals

* City’s Compact, Complete, and Context Sensitive Communities: Development is concentrated in compact, human-scaled, walkable centers and neighborhoods that: connect to transit, offer diverse uses and services, provide housing options for families of all income levels, and minimize the indirect impacts of the built environment on the integrity of ecological systems, dark skies, water consumption, and public health

* STAR Compact and Complete Communities: Concentrate development in compact, human-scaled, walkable centers and neighborhoods that connect to transit, offer diverse uses and services, and provide housing options for families of all income levels

* STAR Ambient Noise and Light: Minimize and manage ambient noise and light levels to protect public health and the integrity of ecological systems
**City’s Food Systems:** There is a collaborative network that integrates sustainable food production, processing, distribution, consumption, and waste management in order to create a locally based, self-reliant food economy where all people, at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient, safe, and nutritious food to meet their dietary needs and food preferences.

**STAR Food and Nutrition:** Ensure that adults and children of all income levels have opportunities to learn about nutritious eating and have physical and economic access to fresh, healthful food.
* **City’s Carbon Neutral City:** Community carbon neutrality is reached through reducing, to the extent possible, the amount of greenhouse gases emitted, and addressing the remainder of those emissions through carbon offsets, while promoting economic vitality and protecting human health

* **STAR Greenhouse Gas Mitigation:** Achieve greenhouse gas emissions reductions throughout the community
Updated Sustainability Goals

* City’s Water Efficiency: Significant and sustained reductions in community-wide potable water use are achieved, and the capture of rainwater and storm water and the reuse of gray water and reclaimed water are used to offset potable water use to the extent possible

* STAR Industrial Sector Resource Efficiency: Minimize resource use and demand in the industrial sector as a means to mitigate greenhouse gas emissions and conserve water

* STAR Resource Efficient Buildings: Improve the energy and water efficiency of the community’s residential, commercial and institutional building stock
**A Centered City:** This is a centered city with a vibrant downtown and urban core that:
is an appealing and valued community asset; embodies the City’s economic heart and cultural soul; represents a shared community vision; acts as a lodestone attracting residents and visitors alike; reflects genuine partnership and coordination between municipal, business, non-profit, and neighborhoods; and is supported by appealing gateways and corridors that connect with other major activity centers.

**Technological Innovation and Investment:** The advanced training and higher education community catalyzes economic growth through technological research and development; technology transfer and sharing of cost and risk of investments in innovation; development of intellectual capital and entrepreneurial spirit; and preparation of local workers with the skills needed for innovation.
Timing is Everything...

* Why have 2 separate plans?
* Isn’t community sustainability what the General Plan is about?
* Consistent with new open government initiative, restructuring
* Amazing amount of consistency
* Reality check
Purpose
Foster economic prosperity and stability by retaining and expanding businesses with support from the business community.

Evaluation Measures

Community Level Outcomes

Outcome 1: Businesses
- Option A: Demonstrate an increased number of business establishments in the county over time
  --OR--
- Option B: Demonstrate an increased number of business establishments in the municipality in the past 3 years

Outcome 2: Annual Sales
Demonstrate an increase in annual sales from businesses located in the jurisdiction in the past 3 years.

Outcome 3: Employment
- Part 1: Demonstrate an increase in the percentage of residents employed over time
  --AND--
- Part 2: Demonstrate a decrease in the unemployment rate of residents over time

Local Actions
1. Negotiate project labor agreements, community benefit agreements, and local hiring agreements
2. Formally engage with the business community on a regular basis to improve conditions and address specific needs
3. Appoint an advisory body to provide recommendations and represent the business community in local decision-making
How We Connected the Dots...

STAR:
* Purpose Statements
* Outcomes
* Actions

Plan Tucson:
* Long-Term Community Sustainability Outcomes
* Progress Metrics
* Used as a policy screen, will be used as ideas for action plans
### The Built Environment

#### Plan Tucson Goals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for a mix of well-maintained, energy-efficient housing options with multi-modal access to basic goods &amp; services, recognizing the important role of homeownership to neighborhood stability.</td>
<td>The City strives for a mix of well-maintained, energy-efficient housing options with multi-modal access to basic goods &amp; services, recognizing the important role of homeownership to neighborhood stability.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for an urban form that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
<td>The City strives for a sustainable community that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
<td>The City strives for a sustainable community that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for a mix of well-maintained, energy-efficient housing options with multi-modal access to basic goods &amp; services, recognizing the important role of homeownership to neighborhood stability.</td>
<td>The City strives for a mix of well-maintained, energy-efficient housing options with multi-modal access to basic goods &amp; services, recognizing the important role of homeownership to neighborhood stability.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for an urban form that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
<td>The City strives for a sustainable community that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
<td>The City strives for a sustainable community that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for a mix of well-maintained, energy-efficient housing options with multi-modal access to basic goods &amp; services, recognizing the important role of homeownership to neighborhood stability.</td>
<td>The City strives for a mix of well-maintained, energy-efficient housing options with multi-modal access to basic goods &amp; services, recognizing the important role of homeownership to neighborhood stability.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for an urban form that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
<td>The City strives for a sustainable community that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
<td>The City strives for a sustainable community that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Plan Tucson Policies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for a local job market that provides opportunities for all Tuchonans to meet their basic needs and pursue career advancement, matched with a well-educated, well-qualified workforce that is able to meet the dynamic needs of businesses and employers.</td>
<td>The City strives for a local job market that provides opportunities for all Tuchonans to meet their basic needs and pursue career advancement, matched with a well-educated, well-qualified workforce that is able to meet the dynamic needs of businesses and employers.</td>
<td>The City strives for a local job market that provides opportunities for all Tuchonans to meet their basic needs and pursue career advancement, matched with a well-educated, well-qualified workforce that is able to meet the dynamic needs of businesses and employers.</td>
<td>The City strives for a local job market that provides opportunities for all Tuchonans to meet their basic needs and pursue career advancement, matched with a well-educated, well-qualified workforce that is able to meet the dynamic needs of businesses and employers.</td>
<td>The City strives for a local job market that provides opportunities for all Tuchonans to meet their basic needs and pursue career advancement, matched with a well-educated, well-qualified workforce that is able to meet the dynamic needs of businesses and employers.</td>
<td>The City strives for a local job market that provides opportunities for all Tuchonans to meet their basic needs and pursue career advancement, matched with a well-educated, well-qualified workforce that is able to meet the dynamic needs of businesses and employers.</td>
<td>The City strives for a local job market that provides opportunities for all Tuchonans to meet their basic needs and pursue career advancement, matched with a well-educated, well-qualified workforce that is able to meet the dynamic needs of businesses and employers.</td>
<td>The City strives for a local job market that provides opportunities for all Tuchonans to meet their basic needs and pursue career advancement, matched with a well-educated, well-qualified workforce that is able to meet the dynamic needs of businesses and employers.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### STAR Sustainability Metrics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for a mix of well-maintained, energy-efficient housing options with multi-modal access to basic goods &amp; services, recognizing the important role of homeownership to neighborhood stability.</td>
<td>The City strives for a mix of well-maintained, energy-efficient housing options with multi-modal access to basic goods &amp; services, recognizing the important role of homeownership to neighborhood stability.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for an urban form that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
<td>The City strives for a sustainable community that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
<td>The City strives for a sustainable community that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Long-term Community Sustainability Outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for a mix of well-maintained, energy-efficient housing options with multi-modal access to basic goods &amp; services, recognizing the important role of homeownership to neighborhood stability.</td>
<td>The City strives for a mix of well-maintained, energy-efficient housing options with multi-modal access to basic goods &amp; services, recognizing the important role of homeownership to neighborhood stability.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community’s carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>The City strives for an urban form that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
<td>The City strives for a sustainable community that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
<td>The City strives for a sustainable community that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal transportation system to enhance the mobility of people and goods.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Arts & Culture

- The City strives for a community whose economic stability and sense of place reflects its commitment to arts and culture and its care for the natural environment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for a community whose economic stability and sense of place reflects its commitment to arts and culture and its care for the natural environment.</td>
<td>The City strives for a community whose economic stability and sense of place reflects its commitment to arts and culture and its care for the natural environment.</td>
<td>The City strives for a community whose economic stability and sense of place reflects its commitment to arts and culture and its care for the natural environment.</td>
<td>The City strives for a community whose economic stability and sense of place reflects its commitment to arts and culture and its care for the natural environment.</td>
<td>The City strives for a community whose economic stability and sense of place reflects its commitment to arts and culture and its care for the natural environment.</td>
<td>The City strives for a community whose economic stability and sense of place reflects its commitment to arts and culture and its care for the natural environment.</td>
<td>The City strives for a community whose economic stability and sense of place reflects its commitment to arts and culture and its care for the natural environment.</td>
<td>The City strives for a community whose economic stability and sense of place reflects its commitment to arts and culture and its care for the natural environment.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Public Health

- The City strives for a community that is healthy physically, mentally, economically, and environmentally.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for a community that is healthy physically, mentally, economically, and environmentally.</td>
<td>The City strives for a community that is healthy physically, mentally, economically, and environmentally.</td>
<td>The City strives for a community that is healthy physically, mentally, economically, and environmentally.</td>
<td>The City strives for a community that is healthy physically, mentally, economically, and environmentally.</td>
<td>The City strives for a community that is healthy physically, mentally, economically, and environmentally.</td>
<td>The City strives for a community that is healthy physically, mentally, economically, and environmentally.</td>
<td>The City strives for a community that is healthy physically, mentally, economically, and environmentally.</td>
<td>The City strives for a community that is healthy physically, mentally, economically, and environmentally.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# THE NATURAL ENVIRONMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Plan Tucson Goals</th>
<th>Plan Tucson Policies</th>
<th>STAR Sustainability Metrics</th>
<th>Long-term Community Sustainability Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ENERGY &amp; CLIMATE READINESS</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for a reduction in the community's carbon footprint and greater energy independence.</td>
<td>EC1, EC2, EC4, EC5, EC6, EC7, EQ7, HP1, LT9, LT13, LT14, LT17</td>
<td>Annual amount of greenhouse gas emissions reductions</td>
<td>Community carbon neutrality is reached through reducing, to the extent possible, the amount of greenhouse gases emitted, and addressing the remainder of those emissions through carbon offsets, while promoting economic vitality and protecting human health.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EC4, LT9, LT11, LT12, LT13, LT14, LT15, LT16, LT17</td>
<td>Annual vehicle miles traveled</td>
<td>Usage of low-carbon and highly-efficient transportation, fleet, and fuel options is maximized and annual vehicle miles traveled is minimized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for a reputation as a national leader in the development and use of locally renewable energy technologies, water conservation, waste diversion and recovery, and other emerging environmentally-sensitive industries.</td>
<td>EC4, EC5, EC6, EC7, E7</td>
<td>Percentage of local energy supply from renewable energy sources; percent ownership of alternative fuel vehicles by residents</td>
<td>Community-wide energy use is reduced to the extent possible, and remaining energy needs are exceeded with renewable and environmentally-benign energy sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for sound, efficient, ecological policies and practices in government and in the private sector.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plan Tucson Goals</td>
<td>Plan Tucson Policies</td>
<td>STAR Sustainability Metrics</td>
<td>Long-term Community Sustainability Outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JOB &amp; WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT</td>
<td>RG5, RG6, JW4, JW6, BC4, AC9</td>
<td>Number of new businesses, annual sales, and total employment in targeted industry sectors.</td>
<td>The advanced training and higher education community catalyzes economic growth through technological research and development; technology transfer and sharing of cost and risk of investments in innovation; development of intellectual capital and entrepreneurial spirit; and preparation of local workers with the skills needed for innovation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for a local job market that provides opportunities for all Tucsonans to meet their basic needs and pursue career advancement, matched with a well-educated, well-qualified workforce that is able to meet the dynamic needs of businesses and employers.</td>
<td>JW1, JW2, JW7</td>
<td>Median household income; percentage of household incomes that meet or exceed the living wage standard.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for a sustained increase in household income and wages, and a sustained reduction in the poverty rate, especially for Tucson’s children, seniors and disabled residents.</td>
<td>JW1, JW2, JW7</td>
<td></td>
<td>Every worker earns a living wage, receives affordable benefits, has access to programs that support families, and can gain upward economic mobility through improved productivity in a safe and non-discriminatory workplace environment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for a community that is healthy physically, mentally, economically, and environmentally.</td>
<td>JW1, JW2, JW7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### THE SOCIAL ENVIRONMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Plan Tucson Goals</th>
<th>Plan Tucson Policies</th>
<th>STAR Sustainability Metrics</th>
<th>Long-term Community Sustainability Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The City strives for a community that is healthy physically, mentally, economically, and environmentally.</td>
<td>PH1, PH2, PH7, PH8, PR3, PR5, PR7, AG3, GI3</td>
<td>Percentage of kids and adults that are physically active</td>
<td>Every resident has fundamental knowledge of, and physical and economic access to, healthy living opportunities that promote an active lifestyle, good nutrition, and physical wellness.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### URBAN AGRICULTURE

| The City strives for a sustainable urban food system. | AG1, AG2, AG3, AG4, PH2, LT10 | Fresh food produced locally; access to low-cost healthy food; nutrition | A collaborative network integrates sustainable food production, processing, distribution, consumption, and waste management in order to create a more locally based, self-reliant food economy where all people, at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient, safe, and nutritious food to meet their dietary needs and food preferences. |

### EDUCATION

<p>| The City strives for an educated citizenry. | E1, E3, E4, E5, E6, E7, ED1 | Reading proficiency; high school graduation rates | Equitable and lifelong educational attainment exists for all residents through a strong public school system, quality educational facilities, and a wide range of learning opportunities that are accessible and appropriately serve all segments and all ages of the populations. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Plan Tucson Goals</th>
<th>Plan Tucson Policies</th>
<th>STAR Sustainability Metrics</th>
<th>Long-term Community Sustainability Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>An urban form that conserves natural resources, improves and builds on existing</td>
<td>LT1, LT9, LT11, LT12, LT13, LT14, LT15, LT16, LT22, LT25, ED5, PR9, PH1, PH4, PH8</td>
<td>Mode split; percent of income spent on transportation costs; pedestrian and bicyclist fatalities; vehicle miles traveled</td>
<td>Safe, affordable, diverse, and efficient mobility options are accessible to all residents, with emphasis on walking, bicycling, and mass transit that reduce vehicle miles traveled.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>public infrastructure and facilities, and provides an interconnected multi-modal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>This is a centered city with a vibrant downtown core that: is an appealing and valued community asset; embodies the City’s economic heart and cultural soul; represents a shared community vision; attracts residents and visitors alike; reflects genuine partnership and coordination between municipal, business, non-profit, and neighborhoods; and is supported by appealing gateways and corridors that connect with other major activity centers.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Process of Implementation

* Will be the overarching guide for all City efforts, budget
* Will have progress metrics, publicly tracked
Next Steps

* Internal restructuring, improved coordination
* Continue to collect data for STAR pilot
* Coordinate with S.AZ Indicators Project
* Finalize Plan Tucson metrics, tracking tools
* Data dashboards
* Develop action plans...
STAR as a Rating System

* Not sure about usefulness...
  * Pilot ratings will not be complete until around May/June
  * Some cities already have metrics; don’t know how STAR can fit
* Issues with metrics
  * Ambient Light and Noise – metric not accurate; biased against cities
  * Community Water Supply – does not handle our situation well
  * Volunteerism – data only exists for some cities; the rest of us have to do surveys
  * Green Infrastructure – doesn’t account for need to balance against water conservation
* Data collection takes a lot of time
* Framework > Rating
Questions?

CLIMATE SUMMIT

WHAT IF IT'S A BIG HOAX AND WE CREATE A BETTER WORLD FOR NOTHING?

- ENERGY INDEPENDENCE
- PRESERVE RAINFORESTS
- SUSTAINABILITY
- GREEN JOBS
- LIVABLE CITIES
- RENEWABLES
- CLEAN WATER, AIR
- HEALTHY CHILDREN
- ETC. ETC.

Leslie Ethen
520-791-4675
Leslie.Ethen@tucsonaz.gov